The Department of Community Planning & Development City Hall, Lynchburg, VA 24504 434-455-3900

To: Planning Commission

From: Historic Preservation Commission

Date: April 13, 2005

Re: Consideration of a Local Historic District (HD) Zoning Designation for an Area to be

Known as the Spencer-Johnson Renaissance Historic District (formerly proposed to be

called the Diamond Hill South Historic District)

I. PETITIONER

Historic Preservation Commission, In care of Department of Community Planning & Development, 900 Church Street, Lynchburg, VA 24504

Representative: Henry C. Devening, Chair, Historic Preservation Commission, In care of Department of Community Planning & Development, 900 Church Street, Lynchburg, VA 24504

II. LOCATION

The petition includes all properties fronting on the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street and including the properties known as 1518 and 1600 Fourteenth Street.

Property Owners: See Appendix B on back of Vicinity Map.

III. PURPOSE

The purpose of the petition is to consider a Local Historic District (HD) zoning designation for an area to be known as the Spencer-Johnson Renaissance Historic District (formerly proposed to be called the Diamond Hill South Historic District) for all properties fronting on the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street and including the properties known as 1518 and 1600 Fourteenth Street.

IV. SUMMARY

- Petition agrees with the <u>Comprehensive Plan's Goals for History, Culture, Education and the Arts:</u>
 - To "Preserve significant historic and cultural resources through the collaborative efforts of the City; historic and cultural groups"..."and other local, state and federal preservation groups and organizations."
 - To "Ensure that future development, redevelopment, and public improvements complement the scale and character, and respect the integrity of, designated historic districts and areas potentially eligible for designation."
- Petition agrees with Greenhorne & O'Mara, Inc.'s <u>Historic Architectural Survey Diamond Hill South</u> Report, dated April 1994 that recommends properties in this area for nomination to the National Register of Historic Places and the Virginia Landmarks Register as a separate Diamond Hill South Historic District.
- Petition agrees with Greenhorne & O'Mara's recommendation to designate most of the Diamond Hill South Historic District as one or more local historic districts.

- Petition agrees with National Register <u>Criteria for Evaluation</u>,
 - ➤ Criterion A: Properties that are associated with events that have made significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history;
 - Criterion B: Properties that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past;
 - ➤ Criterion C: Properties that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

V. Impact

Designating the subject properties as a Local Historic District would:

- Preserve and protect the buildings from inappropriate future alterations;
- Assure that new construction on the vacant lots would be done in character and appropriate designs and standards for this historic district;
- Bring recognition of the historical importance of this neighborhood to the City;
- Make available certain monetary incentives that are exclusive to locally designated historic districts.

The Planning Division recommends approval of the petition.

PLANNING DIVISION RECOMMENDED MOTION

Based on the preceding Findings of Fact, the Planning Commission recommends to the City Council approval of the petition of the Historic Preservation Commission for a local Historic District (HD) zoning designation for an area to be known as the Spencer-Johnson Renaissance Historic District for all properties fronting on the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street and including the properties known as 1518 and 1600 Fourteenth Street.

This matter is respectfully offered for your consideration.

William T. Martin, AICP City Planner

pc: Mr. L. Kimball Payne, III, City Manager

Mr. Walter C. Erwin, City Attorney

Ms. Rachel O. Flynn, Director of Community Planning & Development

Mr. R. Douglas Dejarnette, Fire Marshal

Mr. J. Lee Newland, Director of Engineering

Mr. Gerry L. Harter, Traffic Engineer

Mr. Robert Drane, Building Commissioner

Mr. Kent White, Senior Planner

Mr. Robert S. Fowler, Zoning Official

Mr. Keith A. Wright, Zoning Official

Ms. Annette M. Chenault, Planner II

ATTACHMENTS

- 1. HPC Report dated March 21, 2005
- 2. HPC Minutes of March 21, 2005
- 3. Appendix A: Descriptions of Buildings Within the Proposed Spencer-Johnson Renaissance
 Historic District (formerly proposed to be called the Diamond Hill South
 Historic District)
- 4. Map Showing the Proposed Historic District Boundaries (see attached map)
- 5. Appendix B: Property Owners in the 1300 and 1400 Blocks of Pierce Street and Within 200'
- 6. Appendix C: Pierce Street History
- 7. E-mail from Jolynn Smith dated March 21, 2005
- 8. E-mail from Ron Williams dated March 21, 2005
- 9. Photographs of the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street

The Department of Community Planning & Development

City Hall, Lynchburg, VA 24504

434-455-3900

To: Historic Preservation Commission

From: Secretary

Date: March 21, 2005

Re: CONSIDERATION OF A LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT (HD) ZONING

DESIGNATION FOR AN AREA TO BE KNOWN AS THE DIAMOND HILL SOUTH HISTORIC DISTRICT FOR ALL PROPERTIES FRONTING ON THE 1300 AND 1400 BLOCKS OF PIERCE STREET AND INCLUDING THE PROPERTIES KNOWN AS

1518 AND 1600 FOURTEENTH STREET

I. **SYNOPSIS**

The Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) is considering a local historic district (HD) zoning designation for an area to be known as the Diamond Hill South Historic District for all properties fronting on the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street and including the properties known as 1518 and 1600 Fourteenth Street.

II. SUMMARY

- Petition agrees with the Comprehensive Plan's Goals for History, Culture, Education and the Arts:
 - ➤ To "Preserve significant historic and cultural resources through the collaborative efforts of the City; historic and cultural groups"..."and other local, state and federal preservation groups and organizations."
 - > To "Ensure that future development, redevelopment, and public improvements complement the scale and character, and respect the integrity of, designated historic districts and areas potentially eligible for designation."
- Petition agrees with Greenhorne & O'Mara, Inc.'s <u>Historic Architectural Survey Diamond Hill South</u>
 Report, dated April 1994 that recommends properties in this area for nomination to the National Register
 of Historic Places and the Virginia Landmarks Register as a separate Diamond Hill South Historic
 District.
- Petition agrees with Greenhorne & O'Mara's recommendation to designate most of the Diamond Hill South Historic District as one or more local historic districts.
- Petition agrees with National Register <u>Criteria for Evaluation</u>,
 - > Criterion A: Properties that are associated with events that have made significant contribution to

the broad patterns of our history;

- > Criterion B: Properties that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past;
- > Criterion C: Properties that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of

construction or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose

components may lack individual distinction.

- The HPC may wish to consider naming the proposed Historic District by a name other than "Diamond Hill South." Diamond Hill is the name of an existing Historic District.
- It is questionable whether including the large number of vacant lots and non-contributing buildings in the 1400 block can be justified if challenged under the standards for delineating boundaries of a historic district.

III. FINDINGS OF FACT

Background.

- 1. <u>Petitioner.</u> The Historic Preservation Commission (HPC), In care of Annette M. Chenault, Secretary to the HPC, 900 Church Street, Lynchburg, VA 24504
 - Representative. Henry C. Devening, Chair, HPC, 900 Church Street, Lynchburg, VA 24504
- **2.** <u>Location</u>. The subject properties are located on both sides of the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street and include 1518 and 1600 Fourteenth Street.
- **3.** Purpose. The purpose of the petition is consider a local historic district (HD) zoning designation for an area to be known as the Diamond Hill South Historic District for all properties fronting on the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street and including the properties known as 1518 and 1600 Fourteenth Street.
- **4. Zoning.** The subject properties are zoned R-3, Medium Density, Single-Family Residential District. This petition does not propose to change the existing zoning but proposes a historic district overlay zone for the properties.
- 5. <u>Waivers</u>. No variances or waivers will be needed for the request.
- 6. Development and History. In 1992, through a Certified Local Government Program grant, the City contracted with Greenhorne & O'Mara, Inc., to perform a historic architectural survey for an area to be known as "Diamond Hill South." The survey grew out of a request by the City and the Virginia Department of Historic Resources as to whether the neighborhood might satisfy the National Register of Historic Places criterion. The survey generally encompassed the area bounded by Twelfth Street to the north, Federal Street to the east, the Lynchburg Expressway to the south and Kemper Street to the west.

The survey area was found to possess the necessary architectural and historical significance for listing on the National Register and the Virginia Landmarks registers. Recommendations were for (1) nomination of most of the survey area to the Federal and state registers; (2) nomination of six individual resources to the Federal and state registers; and (3) designation by the City of most of the Diamond Hill South survey area as one or more local historic districts.

At the time of the survey, one historic resource, the Anne Spencer House at 1313 Pierce Street was already listed in the local, state and National registers

7. Proposal to Designate part of Pierce Street as a Local Historic District Zone. On Saturday, November 6, 2004, a ceremony was held and a Virginia highway marker installed at 1306 Pierce Street to honor the memory of Chauncey Edward Spencer, Sr., an aviator who helped African-Americans gain entrance to the Army Air Corps in World War II. Mrs. Anna Spencer, Chauncey Spencer's widow, and other family members inquired of Annette Chenault, Secretary to the HPC, about preserving and protecting the street from further alterations and deterioration. In response to this inquiry, at its meeting on November 15, the HPC requested the Secretary to begin procedures for local historic district designation of the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street.

The HPC held an informational meeting on January 24, 2005, inviting all property owners in the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street. As a result of the meeting, the HPC voted to proceed with the public hearing process.

8. The Comprehensive Plan 2002-2020. The Comprehensive Plan 2002-2020 "Goals for History, Culture, Education and the Arts" provide:

Goal 1 is to "Preserve significant historic and cultural resources through the collaborative efforts of the City; historic and cultural groups"..."and other local, state and federal preservation groups and organizations." Objective 1.A is to "expand efforts to survey, document, and preserve historic sites and structures..."

Goal 3 of the Comprehensive Plan is to "Ensure that future development, redevelopment, and public improvements complement the scale and character, and respect the integrity of, designated historic districts and areas potentially eligible for designation." Designating the subject properties as a local historic district would be one of the first steps in accomplishing this goal.

9. Description of the Proposed Diamond Hill South Historic District.

The proposed Diamond Hill South Historic District encompasses all properties fronting on the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street. Two of these lots have a Fourteenth Street address but also have frontage on Pierce Street. The proposed historic district contains 19 buildings with two accessory structures. It includes mostly residential properties but also includes a church and two stores that are not currently in operation. The 1400 block contains several vacant parcels with the Dr. R. Walter Johnson House and Tennis Courts at the far end at 1422 Pierce Street. The proposed historic district would be the City's seventh historic district and the smallest in area and number of buildings. It would have the potential to expand to one of the largest.

See Appendix A for a description of each building.

10. <u>Justification of Boundaries.</u> The subject properties are located in the northwest corner of what the consultants Greenhorne & O'Mara called the Diamond Hill South Neighborhood. The Diamond Hill South Neighborhood boundaries were originally established for survey purposes and not by any particular defined criteria.

In its report, <u>Historic Architectural Survey Diamond Hill South</u>, Greenhorne & O'Mara found that the portion of the survey area located south and southwest of Grace Street possessed the necessary architectural and historical significance for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and the Virginia Landmarks Register as a separate Diamond Hill South Historic District. The recommendation was made based on the National Register <u>Criteria for Evaluation</u>, as follows:

- Properties that are associated with events that have made significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history;
- > Criterion B: Properties that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past;
- Properties that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

Greenhorne & O'Mara also recommended that most of the Diamond Hill South Historic District should be designated as one or more local historic districts. Within the survey area, the consultants noted that the Dr. R. Walter Johnson House and Tennis Courts are eligible as an individual resource for the National Register of Historic Places and the Virginia Landmarks Register. The Report also noted the properties at 1300 and 1306 Pierce Street as worthy of further study for eligibility in the state and National historic registers.

Based on <u>A Guide to Delineating Edges of Historic Districts</u>, by the National Trust for Historic Preservation, there are several factors to consider in determining the boundaries of a potential historic district. The boundaries for the proposed Diamond Hill South Historic District were based on the following factors:

- An architectural survey. An architectural and historic resources survey and map are valid when the survey is recognized as an official planning document.
- Boundaries are drawn to include properties fronting on both sides of a street.

- Rear property lines have been used as valid edges to the district, especially when it is the
 intent of the ordinance to control the character of development on both sides of a boundary
 street
- For ease in administration, a series of sub districts might be delineated.

The boundaries for the proposed Diamond Hill South Historic District are not intended to be an all encompassing historic district but part of a district that may be expanded to include other buildings of similar architecture and history at some point in the future.

The buildings within the 1300 block of Pierce Street are mostly intact with some minor alterations. The 1400 block, however, has several vacant lots and non-contributing buildings. Consideration should be given to whether the 1400 block should be designated a historic district. Designating the entire block would protect the Dr. R. Walter Johnson House and Tennis Courts at the far (southeastern) end of the block. It would also offer protection against further inappropriate construction. It is questionable whether designating the vacant lots and non-contributing buildings in the 1400 block can be justified if challenged under the standards for delineating boundaries of a historic district.

11. Proposed Name of the Diamond Hill South Historic District. The HPC may wish to consider identifying the proposed historic district by a name other than "Diamond Hill South." Diamond Hill is the name of an existing historic district. Other proposed names that could be considered are "Camp Davis Historic District" and "Spencer Heights Historic District."

IV. PLANNING DIVISION RECOMMENDED MOTION

Based on the proceeding findings of fact, the Historic Preservation Commission recommends to the Planning Commission approval of the petition to designate an area to be known as the Diamond Hill South Historic District for all properties fronting on the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street and including the properties known as 1518 and 1600 Fourteenth Street.

This matter is respectfully offered for your consideration.

Annette M. Chenault Planner II and Secretary to the HPC

pc: Mr. L. Kimball Payne, III, City Manager

Mr. Walter C. Erwin, City Attorney

Ms. Rachel O. Flynn, Director of Community Planning & Development

Mr. William T. Martin, City Planner

Mr. R. Douglas Dejarnette, Fire Marshal

Mr. J. Lee Newland, Director of Engineering

Mr. Gerry L. Harter, Traffic Engineer

Mr. Robert Drane, Building Commissioner

Mr. Arthur L. Tolley, Zoning Official

Mr. Robert S. Fowler, Zoning Official

V. ATTACHMENTS

1. Appendix A Description of Buildings

(see attached map by Community Planning & Development)

DESCRIPTIONS OF BUILDINGS WITHIN THE PROPOSED DIAMOND HILL SOUTH HISTORIC DISTRICT

- a. <u>1300 Pierce Street</u> Contributing* Classic, two-story gable roofed brick *Georgian*. Contains gable-roofed brick garage. <u>Historic Significance</u>: Home of Clarence W. Seay, long-time principal of Dunbar High School, Lynchburg Vice-Mayor and Civic leader.
- b. 1301-03 Pierce Street Contributing store with living quarters built 1867; two-story clapboard with brick commercial front Vernacular. Historic Significance: Typical late 19th century store built on land known as Camp Davis, named after Jefferson Davis. This land is where the Confederate soldiers enlisted into the Army to fight in the Civil War. The store was built by William Calloway and called Calloway's Store. It was the first minority-owned and operated store in Lynchburg. Edward Spencer (Chauncey Spencer's father) later was a partner in the store. It is currently not occupied.
- c. 1306 Pierce Street Contributing house built in 1919; imposing, two-story American Four-Square covered with pebble-dash stucco. Historic Significance: Home of Chauncey Edward Spencer, Sr., (1906-2002) an aviator who helped African-Americans gain entrance to the Army Air Corps in World War II. He was one of the first members of the National Airmen's Association which later became known as the Tuskegee Airmen. Mr. Spencer lived there from 1977 until his death August 21, 2002. His widow Anna Howard Spencer lives there today. Built by Garrett H. Thornhill, well known African-American plaster contractor.
- d. 1309 Pierce Street Contributing church "Wayside Gospel Temple Church of God in Christ" built ca. 1890; one-story frame/shingled Vernacular. Historic Significance: A good example of the many small scale churches built in the African-American area of the City. The Church, originally named "Peaceful Baptist Church," was first used as a community building, known as "Calloway Hall," and was living quarters for homeless ex-slaves.
- e. <u>1310 Pierce Street</u> Contributing house built ca. 1900; one-story *Vernacular* German siding covered with vinyl siding.
- f. 1311 Pierce Street Contributing house built ca. 1900; two-story Shingle Style/American Four-Square. Good example of the nationally popular style. Home of Nelson Payne, Chauncey Spencer's uncle.
- g. <u>1312 Pierce Street</u> Contributing house built ca. 1900; two-story *American Four-Square* frame covered with vinyl siding. Good example of nationally popular domestic style.
- b. 1313 Pierce Street Contributing house built 1903; two-story Modified Queen Anne. The property is currently listed in the National Register of Historic Places and the Virginia Landmarks Register. It was listed in Lynchburg's local Historic Register on February 14, 1978. The area immediate behind the house was once occupied by a garage; the concrete flooring remains. The long, narrow garden, which was laid out and tended by Mrs. Spencer, extends through the block to the street behind. There is a small, one-room shingled cottage
 - named "Edankraal," in the garden at the east end. The house and cottage are virtually unchanged, inside and out. The property contains a Virginia Historic Landmarks Commission sign commemorating Anne Spencer. <u>Historic Significance</u>: Anne Spencer (1881-1975) was a lyric poet of considerable talent. Being both an African-American and a woman, her early achievement of recognition from her intellectual peers was a remarkable feat. Anne Bannister Spencer enrolled in

the Virginia Seminary and Normal School in 1893 and graduated in 1899, valedictorian of her class. In 1901 she married Edward Alexander Spencer and in 1903 moved into their new home at 1313 Pierce Street. She was the first librarian of Dunbar High School. Visitors to the Spencer's house included well-known fellow poets, vocalists, civil rights leaders such as W.E.B. DuBois, Martin Luther King, Jr., and Walter White, the scientist George Washington Carver and public figures as Thurgood Marshall. The first NAACP chapter organized in Virginia was chartered in 1917 in the Spencer's home.

- i. 1314 Pierce Street Contributing house built ca. 1900; two-story frame *Vernacular*. Good example of Vernacular dwelling of early 1900s.
- *j.* 1316 Pierce Street Contributing house built ca. 1900; two-story frame *Vernacular Queen Anne*. Virtually unaltered in appearance. Good example of Vernacular Queen Anne residence.
- k. 1317 Pierce Street Contributing house built ca. 1910; two-story *Shingle Style* covered with vinyl. It was the home of Warrick Spencer, Jr., Chauncey Spencer's uncle.
- L. 1321 Pierce Street Non-Contributing house built ca. 1900; two-story Vernacular. Typical Vernacular dwelling of early 1900s but substantially altered with false stone and vinyl. This house, known as the Spencer Mansion House, was the home of Warrick Spencer, Sr., and his wife Mary and their family.
- m. 1322 Pierce Street Non-Contributing house built ca. 1970; one-story brick Rancher.
- n. <u>1408 Pierce Street</u> Non-Contributing house built ca. 1970; one-story brick *Rancher* with aluminum/vinyl trim.
- *o.* <u>1409 Pierce Street</u>- Non-Contributing house built in 1997; one-story, wood frame dwelling with vinyl siding.
- p. 1410 Pierce Street Non-Contributing house built 1920; one-story wood frame with vinyl siding and extensive alterations. (Greenhorne & O'Mara, Inc., Reconnaissance Survey had listed this house as constructed in the 1970s, but the Assessor's records have the house built in 1920. Other sources indicate that the 1920 date may be more accurate.)
- q. 1411 Pierce Street vacant.
- r. 1415 Pierce Street vacant.
- s. 1419 Pierce Street vacant.
- t. <u>1423 Pierce Street</u> Contributing grocery store built 1910; two-story *Vernacular*. Altered with vinyl siding; vertical vinyl siding on front façade. <u>Historic Significance</u>: One of several corner grocery stores in the neighborhood.
- n. 1422 Pierce Street Contributing house built 1911; two-story American Four-Square. Architectural Significance: Designed by James T. McLaughlin, a former partner of the architect Stanhope Johnson. Also contains a gable-roofed cottage, perhaps used as a small garage. No apparent alterations to the house or cottage. The former tennis court (built ca. 1933) is located on a full city lot to the west of the house. The fence, nets and score posts have been removed from this double court, but two of the metal nets posts remain. The properties contain a plaque and a stone marker commemorating Dr. R. Walter Johnson. Historic Significance: Home of Dr. Robert Walter Johnson (1899-1972),

well-known locally as a prominent surgeon and nationally as the tennis coach of such legends as Arthur Ashe, Althea Gibson and Juan Farrow. He founded the Junior Development Program of the American Tennis Association (the "Negro League" of tennis).

- v. <u>1518 Fourteenth Street</u> Contributing house built ca. 1900; two-story *Vernacular*. Typical early 20th century dwelling. Alterations with aluminum siding. Non-Contributing cinderblock garage at rear (facing Fourteenth Street).
- w. 1600 Fourteenth Street vacant

*"Contributing" means that the building has historical and/or architectural significance and is part of the justification for the petition.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MARCH 21, 2005

PUBLIC HEARING

Consideration of a local Historic District (HD) zoning designation for an area to be known as the Diamond Hill South Historic District for all properties fronting on the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street and including the properties known as 1518 and 1600 Fourteenth Street.

Chair Devening summarized the petition and asked for those who wanted to speak in favor of the petition to come forward.

Hugh Jones, Chairman of the Anne Spencer House and Garden Museum, spoke in favor of the request. He said the matter was on the Board's agenda at its March meeting, and it unanimously supported the local historic designation. He said strictly from a historical perspective, the neighborhood deserves the recognition. He added that he did not know of any other place in Virginia that contains two historical markers across the street from each other and derived from the same family—Anne Spencer and Chauncey Spencer. He submitted a list of properties in the proposed historic district area and historical facts about them. He said he was not aware that an alternate name for the district was being considered and, if the HPC requested, he would consult the Board and submit suggestions.

Sally Schneider, Executive Director of the Lynchburg Historical Foundation, Inc., spoke in favor of the petition. She said the LHF Board of Directors unanimously supports this designation. She said the LHF has been working with the Dr. R. Walter Johnson family for the past few years to save the house. Recently, the LHF and the City of Lynchburg jointly made application to nominate this property to Virginia's Most Endangered Properties List.

Anne Spencer, 1306 Pierce Street, spoke in favor of the request. She said she was the widow of Chauncey Spencer. She said she was speaking on behalf of Chauncey Spencer who worked very hard to preserve Pierce Street. She had promised him that she would continue to protect this neighborhood so that the people who were so important and gave so much to the city would be remembered. She noted that information on Chauncey Spencer's life and works are in the Smithsonian Institution in Washington, D.C. She said the family wanted more of the neighborhood to be protected but supported the two blocks at this time. She said on behalf of the Spencer family who lived on Pierce Street for more than 100 years, she supported the designation. Ms. Spencer suggested that the word "renaissance" be used in the name of the district since Anne Spencer was closely associated with the Harlem Renaissance period.

Chair Devening asked for those who wanted to speak in opposition to the petition to come forward.

Faye J. Elliott, 1317 Pierce Street, said she was opposed to the designation because she felt that too many of the houses had been altered to the point that they no longer qualified for historic designation. She said the house at 1322 was built in the late 60s and is not historic. Others have been altered with inappropriate siding, and the Warrick Spencer store building is in poor condition. She said she was concerned about people who were on a fixed income being required to replicate their houses according to the way they were originally built. She said the Spencer houses and the Johnson House should be historic but not the whole area.

Thomas Jones, 1312 Pierce Street, spoke in opposition to the request. He said he did not like the idea of someone telling him what to do with his property. He was concerned about window replacement and what the HPC would require. Myer Waxler, 123 Cabell Street, and Linda Campbell, L. J. Campbell Properties, volunteered their comments on types of windows and their availability.

Anne Spencer spoke in rebuttal to Ms. Elliott's comments and said the entire neighborhood is not proposed to be designated, just two blocks.

Ms. Chenault read e-mails from Jolynn Smith, Dr. Johnson's granddaughter, dated March 21, 2005 and Ron Williams (member of the Spencer family) dated March 21, 2005 that expressed support for the designation.

Chair Devening explained that property owners would not be required to make changes to their houses and that any existing inappropriate alteration to a house could remain until the property owner chose to change it. Ms. Elliott responded that she was more concerned about the requirements for new improvements rather than repairs. Chair Devening said there would be an effort to preserve the existing architectural features of the building.

Commissioner Fischer said he was concerned about misconceptions about the Historic Preservation Commission and its duties.

The public hearing was closed.

Vice Chair Glass said he recognized concerns about aspects of historic district designation but said that one has to give up something in order to get something. He said the families who have lived there for decades deserve the right to have their properties protected.

Commissioners Calhoun, Fischer and Fogleman expressed their support of the designation.

Commissioner Harvey said it was important to remember how surrounding elements helped to benefit and support the two main historic houses. He said historic district designation would honor all the people in the neighborhood.

Commissioner Mundy said at the informational meeting, the HPC discussed its role, and a majority of the property owners present were supportive of the designation. He also said historically property values increase, and he supported the designation.

Chair Devening said he agreed with Commissioner Harvey in that all people in the neighborhood played a role in its history, and it is a source of pride. He supported the designation.

After further discussion, Commissioner Fischer made the following motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Calhoun and passed by the following vote:

"That the HPC hereby recommends to the Planning Commission and City Council approval of a local Historic District (HD) zoning designation for all properties fronting on the 1300 and 1400 blocks of Pierce Street and including the properties known as 1518 and 1600 Fourteenth Street."

AYES:	Calhoun, Devening, Fischer, Fogleman, Glass, Harvey, Mundy	7
NOES:		0
ABSTENTIONS:		0

After discussion, Commissioner Mundy made the following motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Glass and passed by the following vote:

"That the HPC hereby recommends to the Planning Commission and City Council the Spencer-Johnson Renaissance Historic District as the name for the new historic district."

AYES:	Calhoun, Devening, Fischer, Fogleman, Glass, Harvey, Mundy	7
NOES:		0
ABSTENTIONS:		0

Ms. Chenault gave tentative public hearing dates for the Planning Commission on April 13, 2005 and City Council on May 10, 2005.